

French National Body comments on ISO/IEC 23009-1:2012/PDAM 1

Date:	2012/10/12
-------	------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex/Figure/Table (e.g. 3.1, Table 2)	Paragraph/ List item/ Note (e.g. Note 2)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
FR-001			ed	The document indicates that it is a corrigendum.	Correct the title and page headers.	
FR-002	Changes 1, 2, 4, 6 and 8		ed	The document uses table replacements to add new entries. It is hard to check what the differences are and to detect the additions.	Consider using addition to the existing tables rather than replacements.	
FR-003	Changes 3, 5, 7, 9, 11		ed	The document uses both individual and entire XML replacements to modify XML schema. Is it necessary since the whole new schema is proposed as an electronic attachment?	Remove the schema changes from the word document. If this is still necessary, limit the changes to only the elements that are really changed (ex why is SAPType or VideoScanType involved in the replacement if there is no change to them)	
FR-004	5.10.1	1 st paragraph	ed	In the following sentence, it is not clear what is signalled. "Events may be provided in the MPD or within a Representation in order to signal to the DASH client or an application."	Rephrase the sentence.	
FR-005	Table 20-2	Message element	ed	The Message element semantics mentions "the message box" which is a ISOBMF structure. This does not seem appropriate.	Clarify the semantics.	
FR-006	5.10.3.3.3		ed	"Event Message Box" is a too generic name for a box which is only applicable when used with DASH.	Consider renaming to "DASHEventsMessageBox"	
FR-007	Table 2 and Change 10	usac_channel_configuration	te	DASH is usually codec agnostic, and relies on codec-independent code points.	Consider using codec-agnostic code points for the USAC config descriptor.	
FR-008	Change 4		te	The EventStream element is authorized at the same level as the AdaptationSet (and not inside). This would seem useful to allow selecting different out-of-band event streams.	Consider allowing the EventStream element within an AdaptationSet	
FR-009	5.10.3		te	The use of InbandEventStream is unclear. How should it be interpreted by a client. In particular, what should a client do when it receives in-band	Clarify the use of InbandEventStream, possibly providing an example.	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China) ** = ISO/CS editing unit

2 **Type of comment:** ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NB Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

French National Body comments on ISO/IEC 23009-1:2012/PDAM 1

Date:	2012/10/12
-------	------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex/Figure/Table (e.g. 3.1, Table 2)	Paragraph/ List item/ Note (e.g. Note 2)	Type of comment²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
				events that do not match schemeURI declared in the MPD.		
FR-010	5.10.1		te	The amendment proposes to use "application-specific events". It indicates: "a proper scheme identifier identifies the application such that the DASH client can move the event to the proper application. ". The current DASH Client Model does not describe applications, it only describes DASH Access Engine and Media Engine.	Update the DASH Client model to reflect how applications are meant to be integrated and add examples of multiple applications relying on a single DASH presentation.	
FR-011	5.10.3.3.3		te	It is not clear from the amendment text what the difference is between an Event stream and other Media/Metadata Stream. Except for MPD validity events, the EventMessageBox has: timescale (repeated at each sample), time, duration, and data. This is exactly what tracks and samples carry.	Consider using tracks or providing examples of event streams which cannot efficiently be represented by existing tracks.	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China)

** = ISO/CS editing unit

2 **Type of comment:** ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NB Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.